

**RULES, ENACTMENTS & INTERGOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE
BUDGET MEETING
HELD IN ROOM 318 OF THE
PUTNAM COUNTY OFFICE BUILDING
CARMEL, NEW YORK 10512**

Members: Chairman Sullivan, Legislators Addonizio & Albano

Tuesday

October 10, 2017

(Immediately Following the Economic Development Budget Meeting beginning at 6:00pm)

The meeting was called to order at 6:25pm by Chairman Sullivan who requested Legislator Albano lead in the Pledge of Allegiance. Upon roll call, Legislator Addonizio, Legislator Albano, and Chairman Sullivan were present.

Item #3 - 2018 Budget Review

County Clerk – Account 1410 (pages 24-25)

Motor Vehicles – Account 1411 (pages 26-27)

Records Management – Account 1460 (pages 35-36)

County Clerk Michael Bartolotti stated the budgets in all three (3) departments are straightforward with no major additions. He stated they have been able to operate efficiently this year with the allotment from the 2017 budget. He stated money was requested for equipment in the Records Center (**account 1460**), which will be used for the continuing digitization of records. He stated the digitization has made operations more efficient, will save money in the long run, and is the best way to secure the records for future access and preservation. He stated the money will be used to purchase two (2) computers, which will become work stations to digitize the records even more efficiently. He stated in the Clerk's Office (**account 1410**) money was requested for the purchase of a new passport camera. He stated last year, a new system was purchased and is working very well. He stated excellent revenue is generated through passport photos, which cost \$10.00 per set. He stated with the revenue collected, the new camera will pay for itself in a short period of time. He stated in the Department of Motor Vehicles (DMV) (**account 1411**) they are trying to increase revenues as much as possible.

Chairman Sullivan questioned if there are any new processes being implemented at DMV. He stated he has noticed that the lines have been shorter.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated beginning at the end of this month the DMV will begin issuing REAL ID compliant driver's licenses and non-driver identifications. He stated the Federal REAL ID program begins in 2020, at which time a REAL ID compliant document will be required to board a domestic flight or get into a Federal building. He stated a REAL ID license is not required at this time. He stated if an individual's license is up for renewal before 2020, a decision can be made at the time of renewal to get a REAL ID. He stated in order to get a REAL ID it must be done in person at the DMV office because documentation is required and a new picture will need to be taken. He

stated because the start date had not been set when the budget was being put together, he was not confident to book additional revenue in the 2018 budget; however he foresees a slight increase in revenue for this reason. He stated since individuals who would like a REAL ID are required to physically go to the DMV office, the County's revenue percentage of 12.7% will be captured from those renewals.

Legislator Addonizio questioned what the charge is for the REAL ID.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated there is no additional charge for the REAL ID. He stated the Enhanced driver's license is an additional \$30.00 because it is a WHTI (Western Hemisphere Travel Initiative) document. He stated a WHTI document allows travel by land or sea to Canada, Mexico, and western Caribbean. He stated the REAL ID is not a WHTI document, but will allow travel on a domestic flight. He stated in his opinion, the DMV did the right thing by not setting an additional charge although there is some additional work that goes along with the REAL ID such as scanning the required documents.

Legislator Addonizio questioned if the REAL ID license would act like a passport.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated it will not be like a passport, although a passport is a REAL ID document. He stated a passport book will allow you to travel anywhere. He stated for a domestic flight, the current NYS driver's license will no longer be valid beginning in 2020. He stated between now and then, those who travel or are planning to travel should consider getting a REAL ID document.

Legislator Nacerino questioned if the REAL ID is optional.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated yes, it is optional. He stated at the end of this month, NYS will officially have four (4) types of identification; the current driver's license, the REAL ID compliant, the Enhanced ID, and the not for Federal purposes ID. He stated hopefully after the renewal cycle, there will only be three (3); the REAL ID, the Enhanced ID, and the not for Federal purposes ID.

Chairman Sullivan stated the DMV is actually a big money maker.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated the DMV is a huge revenue generator and they are very fortunate to be able to keep the overhead as low as possible. He stated they strive to run the DMV as "lean and mean" as possible. He stated things have gotten more complicated over the years, an example being the addition of the REAL ID. He stated for each person who comes in to get a REAL ID, there are additional things that must be done such as validating and scanning in their Social Security card, their citizenship or lawful presence, and their proof of residency. He stated these steps will take extra time. He stated despite requesting NYS to provide counties with a higher percentage of the revenue they collect, both individually as County Clerk and through the State Association, they refuse to do so. He stated therefore, they do more with less. He stated the Putnam County DMV sees customers from both inside and outside of Putnam County, which is a testament to the staff at the DMV. He stated the Putnam

County DMV is also in a fortunate geographic location, as it is the southern-most County run DMV office. He stated the State-run DMVs are not as great, therefore customers go to the Putnam County DMV, which provides more revenue for the County. He stated they also actively pursue car dealer work and they do business with car dealerships in the area, Connecticut, Long Island, and New Jersey. He stated that these dealerships choose to work with Putnam County because the paperwork is processed faster than it would be if they sent it to Albany. He stated the DMV is unique because although it is a government service, it has a capitalistic edge to it.

Legislator Gouldman questioned if the promotion of the local DMV has increased business.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated it is difficult to quantify the numbers because it is not easy collecting data from the State DMV. He stated he believes getting the word out about the local DMV helps to bring customers in.

Legislator Albano questioned if the TVs at the DMV show information about the benefit of utilizing the local office.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated yes, there is literature in the DMV office and they put promotional information on the TVs when they can.

Legislator Castellano questioned if license renewal had to be done in person at the DMV.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated if an individual wants the REAL ID, they must go to the DMV in person every second renewal cycle to update the photograph. He stated if a renewal was done this year and the person gets a REAL ID, eight years later they could send the renewal to the DMV without going in person, but the cycle after that an updated picture would be required.

Legislator Castellano questioned if there are more customers utilizing the local DMV.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated yes, the 2018 revenues were adjusted as compared to the 2017 revenues because there was a license renewal blackout for about three (3) years that is now coming to an end. He stated hopefully, the addition of REAL ID will help to increase the revenue even more.

Legislator Addonizio questioned which license an individual would receive upon renewal.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated the individual can choose which license they would like. He stated personally, he believes it is worth the \$30.00 to get the Enhanced license because it will allow for domestic air travel as well as access to Canada and Mexico.

Chairman Sullivan questioned what documentation is needed to get an Enhanced license.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated if an individual has a passport, they should bring their passport book, their social security card, and a proof of ID.

Legislator Scuccimarra questioned what would be needed if someone did not have their social security card.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated a W2 will be accepted in the place of a social security card.

Legislator Gouldman questioned line 52140, Audio Visual Equipment on page 24, account 1410, County Clerk. He stated the revised budget for 2017 was \$4,695 and \$1,695 was spent. He stated there is nothing budgeted in this line for 2018.

Deputy County Clerk James McConnell stated the \$3,000 in the original 2017 budget was for the wireless passport photo printing system. He stated one was purchased utilizing 2016 funds and another from 2017 funds.

County Clerk Bartolotti clarified that the passport camera will be purchased this year, with 2017 funds, therefore nothing was budgeted in the line for 2018.

Legislator Gouldman questioned if that equipment would last for a few years.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated yes, it will.

Legislator Castellano requested County Clerk Bartolotti to speak about e-filing and how it helped this year.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated e-filing is the electronic filing of court documents. He stated Putnam began e-filing about a year ago and it has gone very well. He stated Putnam was the last County in the 9th Judicial District to e-file, which made the transition easier because most of the attorneys in the area were used to it. He stated e-filing makes the office more efficient because they no longer need to scan in all the documents, which they have been doing since 2010. He stated documents from the court were usually sent to the Clerk's Office on Mondays and they also received a lot of mail. He stated there would be boxes of documents to be processed, stamped, indexed, and scanned, which would take hours. He stated the e-filing has made this process much more efficient. He stated the Bar Association was very supportive of this endeavor and the people from the Office of Court Administration that are involved in the program are very helpful and willing to adapt the program to the County. He stated money is being saved on office supplies and copying and space is being saved as well. He stated it also provides the customers the ability to send things to the Clerk's Office electronically rather than having to deliver it in person. He stated the Clerk's Office is also working diligently towards electronic land recording as well. He stated he is hopeful that this will be in place by the end of the year.

Chairman Sullivan stated the County Clerk's Office has really utilized technology to increase efficiency.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated today, technology is everywhere and he is always looking to make things more efficient. He stated the care that the customer receives is always at the forefront of their mission. He stated with the use of technology, records are being preserved much better in the digital format than in the past, as long as they are redundantly backed up.

Chairman Sullivan questioned if these efficiencies will lead to a cost savings in the future.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated yes, he believes it will. He stated as these processes become more embedded into the culture of the office more, time becomes available for the staff to attend to other work. He stated they have already seen this shift in the County Clerk's office in regards to the scanning of court documents. He stated since the court documents no longer need to be scanned, time is being saved and the staff is available to scan other documents, eliminating the potential need to contract with an outside company.

Legislator Castellano stated the County Clerk has done an outstanding job this year becoming acclimated to the e-filing very quickly. He questioned if the hard copy of the court documents are destroyed once they are scanned in.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated the hard copies of the court documents have not yet been destroyed. He stated now that the documents have been scanned in, they now have the opportunity to go back and do some quality control. He stated once the quality control has been done, permission can be requested from the Office of Court Administration to destroy the paper records.

Legislator Gouldman questioned line 426551 Minor Sales Other on page 26 under the DMV (**account 1411**).

Deputy County Clerk McConnell stated the revenue in that line represents the sale of the EZ Pass tags. He stated there is matching revenue within the budget as well.

Legislator Gouldman questioned if the revenue collected from the sale of EZ Pass tags is expected to decrease in 2018. He stated the 2017 budget was revised to \$10,500 in revenue and at this point in the year \$8,325 has been collected.

Deputy County Clerk McConnell stated the EZ Pass tags are selling very well. He stated as the budget is met and exceeded, the amount will be revised through a budgetary amendment.

Legislator Castellano stated the County Clerk's Office has done a great job with the Naturalization Ceremonies. He requested County Clerk Bartolotti elaborate on this process.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated when he became County Clerk in 2015 a top priority of his was to reinstate naturalization at the county level. He stated the Federal Government took naturalization away from the counties in the 1980's, and the population has since become more diverse. He stated throughout that time, the people living in Putnam who were becoming citizens had to travel to Manhattan to do so, which was a time consuming and expensive venture. He stated in 2016 the County Clerk's Office was able to get the naturalization ceremonies back on the County level and they have held four (4) ceremonies each year since with about 40 participants in each. He stated being able to administer the oath of allegiance to a group of individuals who are becoming United States citizens is one of the greatest things he has done in his life. He encouraged everyone to attend a ceremony.

Legislator Gouldman stated the naturalization ceremonies are wonderful. He requested clarification of line 52130, Computer Equipment on page 26 (**account 1411**). He stated \$1,000 was budgeted for 2017 and has not yet been spent and nothing has been budgeted for 2018.

Deputy County Clerk McConnell stated a computer will be purchased this year. He stated \$2,000 was budgeted in line 52120, Office Equipment on page 26 (**account 1411**) to purchase a shredder.

Legislator Gouldman stated the tentative amount in line 51000, Personnel Services on page 35, Records Management (**account 1460**) is less than the requested amount. He questioned what was removed.

Deputy County Clerk McConnell stated the Administration reduced it due to a position that will soon be vacant, so the entry level starting point will be reflected.

Legislator Gouldman questioned what line 54510, Machine Maintenance on page 35 (**account 1460**) is used for.

County Clerk Bartolotti stated there are two (2) high capacity shredders at the Records Center that require maintenance and are the biggest service contracts. He stated the shredders cost about \$5,000 each and the service contracts are expensive. He stated the Records Center also has a wide format scanner and a regular scanner that have service contracts as well.

Legislator Gouldman questioned why there were no funds budgeted in line 54631, Security Monitoring and Rental on page 35 (**account 1460**) for 2018.

Deputy County Clerk McConnell stated that was taken over by the Highway Department.

Legislator Gouldman questioned why the budget lines on page 36 (**account 1460**) showed zeros.

Deputy County Clerk McConnell stated the lines on page 36 represent shared service grants. He stated although they anticipate applying each year to get the grants, the expenses or revenues are not included until the amount being received is confirmed.

Law Department – Account 1420 (pages 28-29)

Chairman Sullivan stated the 2018 Law Department budget is less than the 2017 budget.

Legislator Gouldman questioned why line 423970, Septic Repair is included in the Law Department budget.

Legislator Nacerino stated there is a stipend associated with that line and she would like more information on it as well.

County Auditor Michele Sharkey stated the employee is still doing the work and it is a 20% split.

Commissioner of Finance William Carlin stated years ago the position was 100% funded. He stated when the funding ended, the septic repair program kept going. He stated the County came to an agreement with the DEP (Department of Environmental Protection) that 20% of the salary would be reimbursed through EOH (East of Hudson) WQIP (Water Quality Investment Program) funds. He stated he believes there are five (5) years left.

Lynne Eckardt, Town of Southeast, stated the septic repair program is done in the towns and she questioned what is done at the County level.

Commissioner Carlin stated monitoring and maintenance is required for the program.

Legislator Gouldman stated in 2017 \$300,000 was budgeted in line 54125, Legal Services and so far \$104,482 has been spent. He questioned if the remainder of the funds would be spent by the end of the year. He also questioned why \$250,000 was budgeted in the same line for 2018.

Commissioner Carlin stated most of the funds will be spent. He stated not all bills have been processed at this point. He stated in regards to the 2018 budget, County Attorney Jennifer Bumgarner prepares a forecast of what is on the docket and estimates what funding will be necessary.

Judgement & Claims – Account 1930 (page 45)

Chairman Sullivan stated the Judgement & Claims budget appears to be flat from year to year.

Legislator Gouldman requested clarification of line 54933, Judgements & Claims between 2017 and 2018.

Commissioner Carlin stated the same amount of \$100,000 was budgeted for both years but the 2017 amount was revised to \$225,000.

Board of Elections – Account 1450 (pages 33-34)

Chairman Sullivan requested that Commissioner Carlin address this budget because there are no representatives from the Board of Elections present.

Commissioner Carlin stated there will be state wide elections in 2018; therefore the districts will not be able to be consolidated in an effort to save money as has been done in the past. He stated there will also likely be a Federal primary election. He stated the extra election adds an incredible expense, especially because so few people vote in it. He stated it is a shame that the elections cannot be held at the same time.

Legislator Gouldman questioned what line 54646, Contracts, is utilized for. He also questioned if there was an increased amount budgeted for 2018 due to the additional elections.

Commissioner Carlin stated many of the contracts are for the voting machines. He stated he believes there are contracts that need to be renewed; therefore the budgeted amount was higher than the previous year.

Legislator Jonke questioned if the County owns or leases the voting machines.

Commissioner Carlin stated he would need to check into that.

Legislator Nacerino questioned if there is mandatory software that will be purchased in 2018, as Software Accessories, line 54782 has been increased.

Commissioner Carlin stated he believes software that handles the ballots will be purchased.

Legislator Nacerino stated year to date only \$14.08 has been spent from that line.

County Auditor Sharkey stated it will be used to replace batteries and software for the computers.

Legislator Nacerino stated the use of the budgeted amount is not being demonstrated based on the 2017 spending. She questioned why the line was increased.

County Auditor Sharkey stated the same amount was budgeted in 2017 as well.

Legislator Nacerino questioned why the Department Heads of the departments whose budgets are being reviewed tonight were not present. She stated she believed their attendance should be mandatory as far as speaking to each budget. She stated she would have liked to have a representative from each department.

Chairman Sullivan agreed.

Legislator LoBue stated \$0 was budgeted in 2016 in line 52130, Computer Equipment. She stated \$20,274 was budgeted for 2017 in the same line and \$17,550 was put in the budget for 2018. She questioned what the 2018 funds will be utilized for.

Commissioner Carlin stated he is unsure.

County Auditor Sharkey stated the funds will be used to replace 10-year-old units. She stated tablets will be purchased to be used with Ask ED (Election Decision) software and will be reimbursed with HAVA (Help Americans Vote Act) funds.

Legislator LoBue stated Software Accessories, line 54782, has a budgeted amount of \$4,000. She stated the voting machines are covered under line 54646, Contracts. She questioned how many machines Board of Elections would be getting.

County Auditor Sharkey stated the voting machine equipment and warranties are being renewed.

Legislator LoBue questioned how much one (1) machine cost.

County Auditor Sharkey stated she will find that information.

Legislator LoBue expressed her concern with the large increase in the Contracts, line 54646, between 2016 and 2017.

County Auditor Sharkey stated a piece of election software that they use is \$38,000 and there is a license fee of almost \$20,000.

Legislator LoBue stated she would also like to know if the County owns or leases the machines.

Veterans Service Agency – Account 6510 (pages 166-167)

Legislator Gouldman questioned line 54678, Leased Transportation. He stated in 2017, \$26,000 was budgeted in this line and thus far \$1,309 has been spent. He stated the 2018 tentative amount is for \$10,000 and questioned why it was less than 2017.

Commissioner Carlin stated obtaining volunteers and limiting the amount of rides has been very successful.

Legislator Gouldman stated that is great news.

Chairman Sullivan stated the overall budget for 2018 is less than it was in 2017.

Legislator Gouldman questioned why line 54646, Contracts, has \$0 budgeted in 2018.

Commissioner Carlin stated that line represents the Veterans Peer to Peer program. He stated if they receive a grant in 2018, the line will be amended to represent those funds.

Legislator Scuccimarra stated the Peer to Peer program has grown and is a great organization.

Legislator LoBue questioned the total expenses on the bottom of page 167. She stated the requested amount for the 2018 budget was \$188,639 and the tentative 2018 budget shows \$192,116. She questioned why the amount was increased.

Commissioner Carlin stated the increase is due to the management COLA (Cost of Living Adjustment) in personnel services.

Legislator LoBue questioned how many employees the Veterans Service Agency has.

County Auditor Sharkey stated there are the Director, Deputy Director, and two (2) part time assistant positions.

Legislator LoBue stated the total expenses were about \$337,000 in 2016. She questioned why it was so high.

Commissioner Carlin stated the Peer to Peer program grant is included in that amount. He stated the expense amount shown at the top of page 167 shows the amount without the grant.

Consumer Affairs – Account 6610 (pages 169-170)

Legislator Gouldman questioned what line 419623, Item Pricing was utilized for. He stated the 2018 tentative amount is very different than the amount in 2017.

Legislator Addonizio stated there are no representatives from the department present to speak on this.

Commissioner Carlin stated he would need to check where they are in their two (2) or three (3) year cycle.

Chairman Sullivan questioned what item pricing is.

Legislator Nacerino stated it is for the accountability of the stickers and scanners to ensure everyone is in compliance.

Legislator Castellano stated the amount is lower for 2016 because they are in the middle of their cycle.

Putnam Arts Council – Account 7560 (page 195)

Contribution to Arts – Account 7560 (page 195)

Chairman Sullivan stated there is an increase for 2018 as compared to 2017.

Commissioner Carlin stated County Executive MaryEllen Odell discussed that more arts are going to be brought to Tilly Foster Farm.

Legislator Scuccimarra stated Shakespeare will be performed there.

Humane Society – Account 8512 (page 203)

Legislator Gouldman questioned if the Putnam County Humane Society offers the same services to each town in the County.

Legislator Scuccimarra stated the involvement is up to the town and she believes Putnam Valley opted out.

Legislator Nacerino stated it is contractual.

Legislator Gouldman stated Putnam Valley opted out because they were not receiving services.

Legislator Nacerino questioned if Putnam Valley had a contract with the Humane Society.

Legislator Gouldman questioned if all towns have a contract with the Humane Society.

Legislator Addonizio stated she believes the towns have the option to have a contract with the Humane Society.

Legislator Nacerino stated it is optional, but if there is a contractual agreement the expectations are written out in black and white. She questioned if Putnam Valley had a dog control officer.

Legislator Jonke stated most towns have an agreement with a dog control officer.

Legislator Scuccimarra stated she would like to hear from the Humane Society to discuss how they are structured.

Chairman Sullivan stated they can be requested to attend a meeting.

Ms. Eckardt stated the Town of Southeast has an agreement with the Humane Society as well as a dog control officer.

Legislator Gouldman questioned if the Town of Southeast is happy with the services.

Ms. Eckardt stated years ago when the services were going to be cut, there was a huge outcry from the public. She stated these services are very popular among the residents and she has not heard any complaints about them.

Chairman Sullivan stated he would like the Department Heads and the representatives of the outside agencies to attend these budget meetings.

Legislator Nacerino and Legislator LoBue stated they have always attended the budget meetings.

Legislator Nacerino stated their absence impairs the ability to get meaningful questions answered and to move forward.

Chairman Sullivan stated it was his assumption that the Department Heads and representatives would come.

Legislator LoBue stated they have always attended in the past.

Legislator Albano questioned if letters should be sent from the Legislature notifying the appropriate representative of the meetings and that their attendance would be appreciated.

Clerk of the Legislature Diane Schonfeld stated such a letter would have to go through the County Executive's Office.

Legislator Addonizio suggested that the Humane Society attend the Audit & Administration Budget Meeting.

Legislator Nacerino stated that would be counterproductive to this process. She stated the representatives of each department should be at the appropriate meetings. She stated it is unfair to put the burden on Commissioner Carlin to answer questions for all departments.

Legislator Addonizio questioned when the Humane Society would come if not at the Audit & Administration Budget meeting.

Chairman Sullivan stated any department or organization whose budget is being reviewed should be present at the meeting.

Legislator Addonizio agreed.

Legislator Nacerino stated there was nobody present to represent the Law Department, the Board of Elections, or most of the outside agencies. She requested that the County Executive's Office be contacted to notify them that Department Heads were not present tonight.

Ms. Eckardt stated it is her guess the outside agencies may be under the impression that if there is no change in their budget, they do not need to attend the meeting. She stated she believes it is imperative to make sure a representative attends if there are going to be questions.

Legislator Nacerino stated based on past practice, that assumption does not hold true. She stated there has always been representatives present from both outside agencies and County departments at the meeting during the budget review process.

Legislator LoBue stated this is the first time she has experienced this lack of attendance.

Commissioner Carlin stated at the Department Head Meeting that took place earlier today, he reminded those present to attend their respective budget meeting.

Legislator Nacerino stated having County Clerk Bartolotti and Deputy County Clerk McConnell at the meeting this evening was very informative from a multitude of perspectives.

Legislator Addonizio stated this is her third year on the Legislature and representatives have always been present.

Legislator Nacerino agreed and stated she is very surprised.

Chairman Sullivan stated he would like a representative to come and questioned when the best time for them to come would be.

Legislator Nacerino stated a committee meeting would be the proper venue for the Humane Society to provide an overview not specifically related to funding.

Chairman Sullivan stated it will be beneficial to have an overview from the Humane Society.

Putnam County SPCA – Account 8513 (page 204)

Legislator Albano stated the budget shows a drastic change between 2017 and 2018.

Legislator Jonke stated the 2017 budget allocated \$3,000 for the Putnam County SPCA (PCSPCA). He stated the amount requested in the 2018 budget was \$143,738 and the tentative amount put in the budget is \$40,000. He stated there are no representatives present to discuss this.

Legislator Nacerino stated she believes the PCSPCA are planning on purchasing a vehicle.

Chairman Sullivan stated over the past year he has read in the news that there have been some big events that were dealt with by the PCSPCA.

Legislator Jonke stated there are also dog control officers that address issues involving animals. He stated he recently saw in the newspaper that a car was donated to the PCSPCA.

Legislator LoBue stated she also saw the donation of a vehicle in the news. She stated she supports the PCSPCA, but is surprised at this large increase and that no one is present to discuss the budget. She stated she would like to know what the additional funding will be utilized for.

Legislator Scuccimarra stated the PCSPCA deals with animal abuse cases, while the Humane Society deals with the care and adoption of animals. She stated the PCSPCA and the Humane Society do not get along, therefore in an event where the PCSPCA removes animals from a residence they must bring them to Westchester.

Chairman Sullivan stated he has also heard that the two (2) organizations do not work together. He stated the PCSPCA has a sedan, therefore transporting a large amount of animals could be challenging.

Legislator Jonke stated in 2017, the PCSPCA received \$3,000 from the County and they requested \$143,738 for 2018. He questioned why such a large increase was requested.

Commissioner Carlin stated the PCSPCA requested the same amount of funding that the Humane Society receives.

Legislator LoBue stated the Humane Society has a facility that they need to maintain.

Legislator Scuccimarra stated she would like to know why the two (2) organizations cannot work together.

Legislator Albano suggested halving the \$40,000 in the tentative budget for 2018.

Chairman Sullivan disagreed. He stated the PCSPCA does a lot of work.

Legislator LoBue stated she believes the Humane Society has contracts to work with each town.

Chairman Sullivan stated he believes the Humane Society does have contracts with some towns and the towns provide funding. He stated the PCSPCA assists the Sheriff and the local police within the towns by responding to the animal related cases and doing the policy work associated with each case.

Legislator Jonke stated the PCSPCA are not police officers.

Legislator Castellano stated they are peace officers.

Chairman Sullivan stated he has sat with Chief of the PCSPCA Ken Ross and he believes they provide assistance to both residents and police agencies within Putnam County. He stated a representative should be present to answer more specific questions.

County Auditor Sharkey stated the PCSPCA has requested the funding for vet expenses and fuel costs.

Chairman Sullivan stated when the PCSPCA removes an animal from a residence they are responsible for the care of that animal, which results in vet bills.

Legislator Albano stated they should work with the Humane Society in that respect.

Legislator Gouldman suggested tabling this discussion and collecting more information.

Legislator Addonizio suggested having both the PCSPCA and the Humane Society attend a meeting at the same time.

Legislator Jonke questioned how the PCSPCA has been paying their bills.

Chairman Sullivan stated he believes the vets have been donating their services.

County Auditor Sharkey stated they received a lot of favors.

Legislator Castellano questioned if any of this funding would be used for a vehicle.

County Auditor Sharkey stated no, they received a car from a grant.

Legislator Albano suggested lowering the amount in the tentative budget until a representative can come to discuss the need for the additional funding.

Chairman Sullivan stated he is against cutting the amount in the tentative budget.

Legislator Nacerino stated the PCSPCA is going to utilize the funding for veterinary expenses.

Legislator Albano stated the amount should be provided to the Committee.

Legislator Jonke stated he would like to see bills.

Chairman Sullivan stated he would like to keep the tentative amount of \$40,000 in the budget until the Committee has a chance to discuss the budget with the PCSPCA.

Legislator LoBue stated the budget cannot be changed once it is adopted.

Chairman Sullivan stated he is not looking to change the amount.

Legislator Addonizio questioned if the PCSPCA can attend the Audit & Administration Budget Meeting since they are requesting this increase.

Legislator Nacerino stated Audit should not be the “catch-all” for what should be done under other committees. She stated representatives should be present tonight to address the questions that have been asked.

Legislator Addonizio agreed with Legislator Nacerino. She questioned what to do in this situation where additional funding is being requested and they are not present to answer questions.

Legislator Nacerino suggested requesting a written explanation. She stated \$40,000 is not a lot if they are going to have a contract with a local veterinarian.

Chairman Sullivan questioned if County Auditor Sharkey had written information.

County Auditor Sharkey stated her documentation states the funding will be utilized for fuel costs and that they have been calling in favors for the vet bills.

Legislator Scuccimarra stated if a representative was present to explain their need for the funding, she would consider additional funding.

Legislator Albano stated he would like to see the PCSPCA and the Humane Society working together.

Chairman Sullivan stated it would be great if both organizations were present to discuss this. He stated the PCSPCA has said that they cannot bring their animals to the Humane Society. He stated he would like to have both organizations attend a meeting.

Legislator Nacerino suggested holding a continuation of the Rules, Enactments, & Intergovernmental Relations Budget Meeting next week.

Chairman Sullivan stated a continuation could be held on Tuesday, October 17th.

Legislator Castellano suggested putting half of the funding into sub-contingency and having them come to a committee meeting in the beginning of next year to explain their need for the rest of the funding.

Legislator Albano agreed.

Legislator Scuccimarra stated she would still like to hear why the Humane Society does not work with the PCSPCA.

Legislator Albano stated perhaps the same should be done with the funding for the Humane Society.

Chairman Sullivan disagreed with placing part of the funding in sub-contingency.

Legislator Addonizio agreed with holding a continuation of tonight's meeting.

Ms. Eckardt stated she understands procedure and why the Legislators might be annoyed that representatives are not present.

Chairman Sullivan stated he is not annoyed, it would just help the Legislators to better understand what is being requested and why.

Ms. Eckardt questioned if representatives from the organizations will be asked to attend next Tuesday's continuation of this meeting.

Chairman Sullivan stated yes, the Humane Society and PCSPCA will be asked to attend. He stated if anyone would like another agency to attend the meeting, they can be asked as well.

Legislator LoBue agreed with Legislator Castellano's suggestion of placing half of the funding in sub-contingency. She stated this would allow the PCSPCA to come before the committee after the budget.

Legislator Albano agreed. He stated the money can be moved later on.

Chairman Sullivan stated he would like to leave the full tentative amount in the budget as it is for now.

Please Note: After the meeting, it was determined that a continuation was not necessary.

Cooperative Extension – Account 8750 (page 208)

Chairman Sullivan stated the tentative 2018 budget provides for level funding for Putnam County Cornell Cooperative Extension ("Cooperative Extension") as compared to 2017.

Executive Director Marjorie Keith thanked the County for their support. She stated in 2016 the County appropriation of about \$322,000 was leveraged into a \$1.6 million program. She stated Cooperative Extension works with resources and funding brought in from the State level, the Federal level, other sources, and has the value of many volunteers. She stated there are three (3) Professional Educators that supervise over 300 volunteers that reach out to all corners of Putnam County, bringing the research and resources of Cornell University. She stated Cooperative Extension interfaces with over 100 agencies and organizations at the town, county, state, and federal levels to bring programming to Putnam County. She stated the funding provided by Putnam County goes directly into programming. She stated their programs primarily focus in three (3) areas; enhancing the environment, strengthening youth and families, and community and economic vitality. She stated Cooperative Extension has a very dedicated core of volunteers and a great Board of Directors who oversee the

organization. She stated Cooperative Extension operates on a very tight and frugal budget. She stated the County Contribution, line 54950, is level to the funding allocated in 2017. She stated a 3% increase was requested, which would equate to about \$9,000. She stated one of the things that impacted their 2017 was the increase in minimum wage, which they did not factor in when putting the budget together. She stated this will again impact them in 2018. She stated in 2016 minimum wage was \$9.00 per hour, which increased to \$9.70 in 2017 and will increase to \$10.40 in 2018. She stated this impacts Cooperative Extension during the summer when three (3) student interns are hired to assist with the Putnam County 4-H Fair. She stated that increase alone will result in a \$2,000 increase. She stated they are looking into consolidating services and maximizing resources. She stated things have become more bureaucratic and there are more accountabilities and regulations to be followed, which require higher levels of expertise and have costs attached to them. She stated a shared business network has been created with the seven (7) counties in the Hudson Valley to provide the level of staff needed to provide these services to keep Cooperative Extension in compliance. She stated they have resources in the area of Information Technology, Human Resources, and Finance. She stated there is a cost sharing associated with the shared business network where a formula is used to determine the amount that each Cooperative Extension will owe. She stated in 2018, Putnam County Cornell Cooperative Extension's share will be \$1,200 higher than in 2017. She stated United Way submitted an ALICE (Asset Limited Income Constrained and Employed) report at a National level and it stated that in Putnam County, a sustainable household budget for a single adult would require an income of \$45,060 to make ends meet. She stated this does not allow for much flexibility. She stated there are professional staff members whose salary just barely meets the amount outlined in the ALICE report. She stated their budget includes a 2% salary increase for the employees. She stated since 2006 Putnam County's contribution to Cooperative Extension has increased 9%, but the consumer price index has increased about 26% since 2006. She stated she believes Cooperative Extension has made good use of the funding they have received and they are always looking for ways to cut costs and find other sources of revenue. She stated the resources of Cornell are brought to the residents of Putnam County and all information is research based and reliable. She stated Cooperative Extension works closely with some County Departments such as the Health Department and Highways & Facilities. She stated they focus on issues that are important to the County as they relate to obesity, the environment, pesticide management, environmental stewardship, and youth development. She stated in their 4-H development program there are many children who receive positive youth development skills. She stated the summer interns that have worked with Cooperative Extension in the past few years are individuals who have come up through the 4-H program. She stated the interns do a lot of work relating to the 4-H fair and it gives them the experience to see Cooperative Extension as both a youth member and an employee.

Legislator Jonke questioned how many employees are working at Cooperative Extension.

Executive Director Keith stated there are seven (7) full time employees and one (1) part time employee.

Legislator Albano stated Cooperative Extension does a lot of work with eight (8) employees.

Legislator Addonizio stated Cooperative Extension is indispensable in Putnam County. She requested information on the Tilly Foster agricultural program.

Executive Director Keith stated Cooperative Extension is part of the Eastern New York Commercial Horticulture Program, which is a regional program with Cornell faculty in a variety of different commodity areas as it relates to fruits, berries, field crops, vegetables, business management, integrated pest management, and business marketing. She stated for a small amount of money, Cooperative Extension is able to buy into that program and provide a level of expertise that cannot be provided locally. She stated there are two (2) plots at the community garden at Tilly Foster Farm that are managed and taken care of by their master gardener volunteers who are there on a regular basis. She stated they also use the garden as the site of their gardening workshops for a hands-on demonstration. She stated the produce grown at the community garden is donated to a food pantry.

Legislator Addonizio stated it is located right across from Tilly Foster Farm.

Executive Director Keith stated yes. She stated as Tilly Foster Farm develops, they are looking for ways to integrate their programming. She stated for example, if BOCES or Homestyle Catering was interested in culinary herb gardening, they could show them how that could be done in an environmentally sound manner utilizing proper techniques. She stated they are open to how more programming could be brought to Tilly Foster Farm. She stated for example, the junior vet science program works with four (4) veterinarian groups within Putnam County and at Tilly Foster Farm.

Secretary to the Putnam County Cornell Cooperative Extension Board of Directors William Giles stated the biggest asset Cooperative Extension has is Executive Director Keith.

Chairman Sullivan and Legislator Addonizio thanked Executive Director Keith.

Item #4 – Other Business – None

Item #5 – Adjournment

There being no further business at 7:53pm Chairman Sullivan made a motion to adjourn; Seconded by Legislator Albano. All in favor.

Respectfully submitted by Administrative Assistant Beth Green.